

Redacted Document - Five Pages:

All redactions made pursuant to 6 and 7c.

**Socha, Julianne**

---

**From:** Socha, Julianne  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 22, 2013 8:18 AM  
**To:** Alexander, Cathy  
**Subject:** RE: Ohio Citizen's Complaint

Thanks for the update!

---

**From:** Alexander, Cathy [mailto:Cathy.Alexander@epa.state.oh.us]  
**Sent:** Friday, August 16, 2013 6:36 AM  
**To:** Socha, Julianne  
**Subject:** RE: Ohio Citizen's Complaint

Hi Julianne,

I am not aware of any new issues or changes to the facility. I will try to get this on our list of unpermitted operations to inspect in the next fiscal year, but at this point I have no reason to believe they are discharging, so we've not been involved with them. Sorry I'm not much help!

Cathy

Cathy Alexander, P.E., Manager  
Modeling and Assessment Section and CAFO Unit  
Division of Surface Water  
50 West Town Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Phone: 614-644-2021

---

**From:** Socha, Julianne [mailto:socha.julianne@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 15, 2013 5:55 PM  
**To:** Alexander, Cathy  
**Subject:** FW: Ohio Citizen's Complaint

Hello Cathy,

EPA has received another complaint from \_\_\_\_\_ and I have been assigned to prepare a response. Below is an email exchange between you and I in February 2012 regarding a previous complaint. If you have any new information on the status of this facility please let me know. I have also contacted my counterparts in EPA enforcement and have information they obtained from ODA in preparation of a response to a recent inquiry from Senator Brown on behalf of \_\_\_\_\_ so I think I'm current the status of the facility with the PTO issued by ODA.

THANKS,  
julianne

Julianne Socha  
NPDES Programs Branch  
Water Division, US EPA, Region 5  
77 West Jackson Blvd., WN-16J  
Chicago, IL 60604  
312-886-4436  
[socha.julianne@epa.gov](mailto:socha.julianne@epa.gov)

**From:** Julianne Socha [<mailto:Socha.Julianne@epamail.epa.gov>]  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 15, 2013 3:05 PM  
**To:** Socha, Julianne  
**Subject:** Fw: Ohio Citizen's Complaint

----- Forwarded by Julianne Socha/R5/USEPA/US on 08/15/2013 03:04 PM -----

From: Julianne Socha/R5/USEPA/US  
To: "Alexander, Cathy" <[Cathy.Alexander@epa.state.oh.us](mailto:Cathy.Alexander@epa.state.oh.us)>,  
Cc: "Bernstein, Jon" <[jon.bernstein@epa.state.oh.us](mailto:jon.bernstein@epa.state.oh.us)>  
Date: 02/15/2012 07:43 AM  
Subject: RE: Ohio Citizen's Complaint

---

thanks! The background information was very helpful. Do you know who the ODA contact is?

"Alexander, Cathy" ---02/15/2012 06:31:20 AM---Hi Julianne, Yes, we have a long history with submitted this same complaint to Regi

From: "Alexander, Cathy" <[Cathy.Alexander@epa.state.oh.us](mailto:Cathy.Alexander@epa.state.oh.us)>  
To: Julianne Socha/R5/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: "Bernstein, Jon" <[jon.bernstein@epa.state.oh.us](mailto:jon.bernstein@epa.state.oh.us)>  
Date: 02/15/2012 06:31 AM  
Subject: RE: Ohio Citizen's Complaint

---

Hi Julianne,

Yes, we have a long history with submitted this same complaint to Region 5 before and I sent up documentation and a response at that time, which I have attached.

In short, we have not found any evidence to substantiate complaint, and have rarely documented any real problems with this facility. Also, at this point the issues raises are so old we no longer have complete records (they were built over 20 years ago).

This facility does not have an NPDES permit, and we have no evidence of discharges. They do have an operating permit with the Ohio Dept. of Agriculture, and so are inspected 2x per year by ODA staff.  
Hope that helps,

Cathy Alexander, P.E., Manager  
Modeling & Assessment Section and CAFO Unit  
Division of Surface Water  
Ohio Environmental Protection Agency  
50 West Town Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Phone: 614-644-2021

-----Original Message-----

From: Julianne Socha [<mailto:Socha.Julianne@epamail.epa.gov>]  
Sent: Tuesday, February 14, 2012 6:55 PM  
To: Alexander, Cathy  
Subject: Ohio Citizen's Complaint

Hi Cathy,

I received a citizen complaint about an Ohio CAFO. The citizen is ----  
complaint is about a CAFO built in the late 1990's. The name called the CAFO was the  
(not sure of last name  
spelling). According to the CAFO is now owned by story is that  
when the CAFO was sited it was intended to be built at one location however, the CAFO was  
actually built at a different location. Additionally believes the CAFO has filled  
wetlands. also has odor concerns which has already raised to ARD's attention.

So, just wondering if you've had any past contact with this citizen ) or if  
OEPA has inspected the facility is concerned about and what OEPA's findings were?  
Any permit information you can share would be welcome also.

Not sure if there is anything for EPA to do but I told I would make inquiries about  
the facility's NPDES status and call back.

Thanks for any info you can share.

julianne

Julianne Socha  
NPDES Programs Branch  
Water Division, US EPA, Region 5  
312-886-4436  
[socha.julianne@epa.gov](mailto:socha.julianne@epa.gov)

----- Message from "Alexander, Cathy" <[Cathy.Alexander@epa.state.oh.us](mailto:Cathy.Alexander@epa.state.oh.us)> on Fri, 15 Jan 2010 15:21:08 +0000 -----

To: "Gluckman.Matthew@epa.gov"  
<[Gluckman.Matthew@epa.gov](mailto:Gluckman.Matthew@epa.gov)>  
Subject: - Poultry Farm Concern  
Matt,

Here is the information I provided to our legislative liaison when she was responding to a similar letter.  
Let me know if you have any questions.  
Cathy

Cathy Alexander, Supervisor  
Modeling and Assessment Section and CAFO Program  
Division of Surface Water  
Ohio Environmental Protection Agency  
50 West Town Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Phone: 614-644-2021  
FAX: 614-644-2745

----- Message from "Alexander, Cathy" <[Cathy.Alexander@epa.state.oh.us](mailto:Cathy.Alexander@epa.state.oh.us)> on Wed, 21 Oct 2009 19:21:50  
+0000 -----

To: "Freeman, Tracy"  
<[Tracy.Freeman@epa.state.oh.us](mailto:Tracy.Freeman@epa.state.oh.us)>  
cc: "Bournique, Randy"  
<[Randy.Bournique@epa.state.oh.us](mailto:Randy.Bournique@epa.state.oh.us)>

Subject: Re: Fv - Poultry Farm Concern  
Hi Tracy,

I found some information about the allegations made by \_\_\_\_\_. As stated in Sen. Brown's letter, \_\_\_\_\_ believes that the original permit for the farm was \_\_\_\_\_.

The "original" permit issued by Ohio EPA was a management plan approval for the manure handling, issued December 28, 1990. At that time, the Ohio EPA did not issue permits to install for the actual barns themselves, so we did not approve the exact location of the poultry barns. \_\_\_\_\_ was advised of the fact that no PTI was issued when we dismissed one of \_\_\_\_\_ verified complaints in 1998. See response to Item 1 in second attachment.

There was a map included in the application for the management plan that we approved (first attachment) that seemed to indicate the location would be \_\_\_\_\_. In short, the information we found in our files do not support \_\_\_\_\_ allegation that Ohio EPA issued a permit for the facility in a different location.

On the wetland issue, we found a copy of a May 4, 1990 letter from Ohio EPA indicating that the Corp of Engineers ruled that the first episode was covered by the nationwide permit. With respect to some renewed filling, Ohio EPA asked the Corp to conduct an individual review of the project, rather than simply allow coverage under a nationwide permit. See third attachment. However, these files are so old we were not able to locate any information on the outcome of that request.

I hope that helps. If you need more details, let me know.  
Cathy

>>> Rick Wilson 10/5/2009 3:57 PM >>>

>>> Tracy Freeman 10/5/2009 1:24 PM >>>  
Hi Rick,

I am sending you this because \_\_\_\_\_ lives \_\_\_\_\_ which is now permitted by ODA, however \_\_\_\_\_ references the original permit and also states that a wetland was illegally filled (you have to read through all the letters). I dimly remember \_\_\_\_\_ name from my PIC days so I know \_\_\_\_\_ has been actively voicing \_\_\_\_\_ concern for many years. Ag called me saying they didn't know how to address the historical permitting concerns \_\_\_\_\_ raised. Any suggestions or help you can give is appreciated.

Thanks.

*Tracy S. Freeman*  
Tracy S. Freeman  
Legislative Liaison  
Ohio EPA  
50 W. Town Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, OH 43215  
(614) 644-2782  
(614) 644-3184 (fax)

>>>> Tracy Freeman 9/15/2009 5:45 PM >>>>

Hi Guys,

I don't know if this letter got lost or what as it is from a year ago. I had a sticky note on it with Adam's no. and saying I sent it to Ag on 8/13/08. Anyway, can you please route this constituent concern from Sherrod Brown's office to the proper staff and then let me know where it goes? Thanks.

*Tracy S. Freeman*

Tracy S. Freeman  
Legislative Liaison  
Ohio EPA  
50 W. Town Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, OH 43215  
(614) 644-2782  
(614) 644-3184 (fax)

>>>> Tracy Freeman 9/15/2009 5:40 PM >>>>

Hi Courtney,

I sincerely apologize for the appearance of our agency not responding to this inquiry from over a year ago. I had noted on the original letter in my file that I forwarded this to the Ohio Dept. of Agriculture legislative office on August 13, 2008. They are the proper state agency to handle this inquiry. I will resend the entire document (including your cover letter) to their office and follow up with them to insure they received it. Sorry this has happened and we'll make sure you receive a response.

Thanks Courtney.

*Tracy S. Freeman*

Tracy S. Freeman  
Legislative Liaison  
Ohio EPA  
50 W. Town Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, OH 43215  
(614) 644-2782  
(614) 644-3184 (fax)[attachment "20091021144414472.pdf" deleted by Julianne Socha/R5/USEPA/US]  
[attachment "20091021143634893.pdf" deleted by Julianne Socha/R5/USEPA/US] [attachment  
"20091021145126894.pdf" deleted by Julianne Socha/R5/USEPA/US]